

From: **James E. Enstrom** <jenstrom@ucla.edu>

Date: Mon, Oct 25, 2021 at 12:10 PM

Subject: Request to Address Serious NASEM NAAQS Committee Issues

To: Clifford S. Duke <cduke@nas.edu>

Cc: Armistead G. Russell <ted.russell@ce.gatech.edu>, Elizabeth A. Stuart <estuart@jhu.edu>,

Sammantha Magsino <smagsino@nas.edu>, Raymond Wassel <rwassel@nas.edu>

October 25, 2021

Clifford S. Duke, Ph.D.

Director, Board on Environmental Studies and Toxicology  
National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine  
500 Fifth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
[cduke@nas.edu](mailto:cduke@nas.edu)

Dear Dr. Duke,

In response to your October 4, 2021 email message, I request that the comments to the NASEM NAAQS Committee website (<https://www8.nationalacademies.org/pa/feedback.aspx?type=project&key=DELS-BEST-20-06>) be made public, like comments to EPA (<https://www.regulations.gov/>). It is important that all interested parties be able to see the comments submitted to the NASEM website.

I reiterate my request for the removal of NASEM NAAQS Committee Member Francesca Dominici (<https://junkscience.com/2021/09/enstrom-calls-on-nas-to-drop-junk-scientist-dominici-from-air-quality-committee/>). Also, I request the removal of the NASEM IRIS Committee Chair Lisa Bero, who has engaged in extensive defamatory attacks on me and other honest scientists who oppose the EPA agenda (<http://scientificintegrityinstitute.org/BeroJEE072021.pdf>), and NASEM IRIS Committee Member Corwin Zigler, who has close ties to Dr. Dominici (<http://scientificintegrityinstitute.org/ZiglerJEE081121.pdf>).

If NASEM is unable to remove these three committee members, then at least it must reveal how they were nominated and selected. They provide strong evidence that these committees *lack* balance of perspectives and *have substantial* conflicts of interest, in violation of the appointment process ([https://www8.nationalacademies.org/pa/information.aspx?key=Committee\\_Appointment](https://www8.nationalacademies.org/pa/information.aspx?key=Committee_Appointment)). If they remain, these members will seriously damage the credibility of the final reports of these committees.

FYI, because of an *aggressive* regulatory agenda, *deliberate* falsification of the research record, *extreme* publication bias against null findings, *misuse* of the Medicare records for 69 million Americans, and *massive* conflicts of interest, legal action against EPA, CASAC, and SAB has been taken on October 7 (<https://junkscience.com/2021/10/biden-epa-sued-for-illegally-stacking-science-advisory-panels/>), October 21 (<https://junkscience.com/2021/10/preliminary-injunction-sought-in-young-v-epa/>), and October 28 (<https://junkscience.com/2021/10/former-casac-chair-added-as-plaintiff-in-young-v-epa/>). Extensive details supporting these lawsuits have been prepared and these details will be presented to EPA on November 17, 2021 (<https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2021/09/22/2021-20439/notification-of-public-meetings-of-the-clean-air-scientific-advisory-committee-particulate-matter>).

Although America currently faces many serious problems, EPA, CASAC, SAB, and NASEM are focused on the PM2.5 NAAQS in a country where the average annual population-weighted PM2.5 level is 7.7  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$ , far lower than the level of 48  $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$  in the competitor nation of China (<https://www.stateofglobalair.org/>). The US PM2.5 level is among the lowest in the World and is essentially the lowest achievable level, given that PM2.5 from China comes over the Pacific Ocean to the US, particularly to California (<https://www.zmescience.com/ecology/environmental-issues/about-29-of-san-franciscos-pollution-comes-from-china-42334/>).

In conclusion, the NASEM NAAQS and NASEM IRIS Committees need to address all of the above issues.

Thank you very much for your consideration.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE  
Retired UCLA Research Professor (Epidemiology)  
President, Scientific Integrity Institute  
<http://scientificintegrityinstitute.org/>  
[jenstrom@ucla.edu](mailto:jenstrom@ucla.edu)