From: James E. Enstrom < jenstrom@ucla.edu>

Date: Tue, July 9, 2019 at 2:30 PM PDT **To:** Wayne Nastri < wnastri@aqmd.gov >

Cc: Jo Kay Chan Ghosh < <u>ighosh@aqmd.gov</u>>, Philip M. Fine < <u>pfine@aqmd.gov</u>>

Subject: Request for SCAQMD Appeal to EPA to Suspend 2016 AQMP

July 9, 2019

Wayne Nastri SCAQMD Executive Officer wnastri@aqmd.gov

Dear Executive Officer Nastri,

I am writing again because you ignored my April 24, 2019 email message below and because you incorrectly stated in the July 1, 2019 Los Angeles Times "War on Southern California Smog" article that the Trump administration "would jump at the opportunity to withhold [federal] funds immediately — even beforehand if they could." Rather than withholding funds, the Trump administration would welcome from SCAQMD an appeal to suspend the estimated \$14 billion implementation of the 2016 AQMP. I and other highly qualified scientists can convincingly explain to EPA that the air in Southern California is already clean enough and that the additional regulations proposed in the 2016 AQMP are not justified on a scientific, public health, or economic basis

(http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/GhoshAll013017.pdf). My evidence is consistent with the July 8, 2019 "Remarks by President Trump on America's Environmental Leadership" (https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefings-statements/remarks-president-trump-americas-environmental-leadership/). The President's remarks included these sentences "One of the main messages of air pollution — particulate matter — is six times lower here than the global average." and "From 1970 to 2018, U.S. criteria air pollution fell 74 percent, while the economy grew by 275 percent. . . . emissions of all the criteria air pollutants continue to decline."

If you and the SCAQMD staff will not submit an appeal to EPA, then I will propose that the appeal be submitted by the SCAQMD Governing Board and/or adversely impacted groups like the Los Angeles County Business Federation (https://bizfedlacounty.org/blog/alerts/action-alert-tell-the-aqmd-that-you-support-jobs-and-the-economy/).

Please respond to me as soon as possible regarding my request for an appeal to EPA.

Thank you very much.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute <u>jenstrom@ucla.edu</u> (310) 472-4274

cc: HEO Jo Kay Chan Ghosh jghosh@aqmd.gov
DEO Philip M. Fine pfine@aqmd.gov

From: "James E. Enstrom" < jenstrom@ucla.edu>

Date: April 24, 2019 at 5:00:24 PM PDT **To:** "'Wayne Nastri'" < wnastri@aqmd.gov >

Cc: "'Jo Kay Chan Ghosh'" <jghosh@aqmd.gov>, "'Philip M. Fine'" <pfine@aqmd.gov>

Subject: Strong Evidence Opposing Further SCAQMD Regulations and SB 732

April 24, 2019

Wayne Nastri SCAQMD Executive Officer wnastri@aqmd.gov

Dear Executive Officer Nastri,

I strongly disagree with several aspects of your April 23, 2019 Los Angeles Daily News OpEd "What's the air quality in SoCal really like?" (https://www.dailynews.com/2019/04/23/whats-the-air-quality-in-socal-really-like/). I particularly dispute your contention that "We work hard every day to protect the health of the people we serve, but we need more support." SCAQMD has already imposed enough regulations on PM2.5, ozone, and NOx and should not receive additional support from general public sources like SB 732. Instead, SCAQMD should submit an appeal to US EPA that any further air pollution regulations in the South Coast Air Basin are not justified on a scientific, public health, or economic basis. Strong evidence supporting my position is provided in the April 18, 2019 article "Real USC Scandal: TAX \$\$ Produces Junk Science Studies" (http://www.capoliticalreview.com/capoliticalnewsandviews/real-usc-scandal-tax-produces-junk-science-studies/) and in my January 30, 2017 email to Health Effects Officer Jo Kay Chan Ghosh criticizing the 2016 AQMP (http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/GhoshAll013017.pdf).

(http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/onosil/moisoi/.pui).

Please respond to me as soon as possible regarding the above items.

Thank you very much.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute jenstrom@ucla.edu (310) 472-4274

cc: HEO Jo Kay Chan Ghosh jghosh@aqmd.gov
DEO Philip M. Fine pfine@aqmd.gov