May 6, 2022

Nigel Bark, MD Chair, Board of Trustees American Council on Science and Health PO Box 1791 New York, NY 10156-1791

Dear Nigel,

Effective July 1, 2022, I will retire as an ACSH Trustee after 16 years of service. Also, effective July 1, 2022, I will retire as an ACSH Scientific Advisor after 38.5 years of service. I am ending my involvement with ACSH because I am now working with several other organizations that appreciate my epidemiologic expertise and that allow me to express my views. In spite of my status as a Trustee and Scientific Advisor, ACSH has not allowed me to publish my views on ACSH.org. In addition, I have been unable to communicate with certain ACSH staff and my suggestions for improving ACSH have been rejected. Finally, I was informed on April 6, 2021 by President Golab that I have "lost the confidence of every other Trustee."

In order to end my relationship with ACSH positively, I request that President Golab respond to my April 8, 2021 letter and correct the false statements that he made about me in his April 6, 2021 letter. Both letters are contained in the attached PDF. I request that President Golab send these corrections to me and the other ACSH Trustees before June 27, 2022 Trustees Meeting.

For your information, I have a large packing box with ACSH booklets and other ACSH material dating back 40 years if ACSH has an interest in retaining this historical material.

Thank you very much for our assistance.

Best regards,

Jim



Respo...21.pdf

April 8, 2021

Thom Golab, President American Council on Science and Health 135 Madison Avenue, 5th Floor, 06-114 New York, NY 10016-6745 <u>https://www.acsh.org/</u>

Dear President Golab,

In response to your April 6, 2021 letter requesting that I resign as an ACSH Trustee (pages 2-3 of this PDF), I will not resign. Your letter is filled with false and/or out-of-context claims about me that are not justified. During my 37-year pro bono service to ACSH as a Trustee and Scientific Advisor I have ALWAYS acted in ways that I believe have been in the best interest of ACSH as it was founded. However, it is obvious that ACSH has changed dramatically since 2014 and that my service and my expertise are no longer wanted. Thus, I will not participate in the April 12, 2021 ACSH Trustees Meeting and my status as an ACSH Trustee can be resolved at a separate meeting of Trustees. This letter and the other pages challenge three of your claims and I request that the other Trustees be given my response (this PDF).

My challenge to your claim 1 regarding Dr. Dinerstein is given in pages 4-7 of this PDF. My challenge to your claim 2 regarding Dr. Berezow is given in pages 8-11 of this PDF. Your claim "At the Trustees' June 6, 2019, meeting, you ignored ACSH's successful efforts to end deficit spending and proposed that ACSH be terminated, with its website being handed to you and two friends of yours (neither of whom had been active in ACSH matters)" is utterly false. The June 6, 2019 "Enstrom Proposal to Continue ACSH.org if ACSH Itself Cannot Continue" clearly states "This proposal is an emergency backup plan to be implemented only if the current ACSH Executive Team cannot maintain ACSH as a fiscally viable organization consistent with its Mission. I propose to have the ACSH.org website, existing publications, and potentially other assets maintained by a small group of scientists who have had a long relationship with ACSH, Beth Whelan, and its Mission. . . ." Full details are given on pages 12-16 of this PDF.

I believe that your letter is a reflection of the changes in ACSH and of the polarization that exists in science today, as described in the 2016 City Journal article by John Tierney "The Real War on Science" (https://www.city-journal.org/html/real-war-science-14782.html). ACSH now presents the "liberal" version of science and health by Drs. Berezow, Dinerstein, and Bloom, not the "conservative" version of science and health by experts like myself. An example of my version of science is given in this June 11, 2020 "Special Report: The Renegade California Scientist Helping Trump Dismantle Environmental Law" (https://www.newsmakerswithjr.com/post/special-report-the-renegade-california-scientist-helping-trump-dismantle-environmental-law).

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE ACSH Trustee since 2006 and ACSH Scientific Advisor since 1984 Retired UCLA Research Professor (Epidemiology) and President, Scientific Integrity Institute 907 Westwood Avenue #200 Los Angeles, CA 90024-2904 http://scientificintegrityinstitute.org/ jenstrom@ucla.edu (310) 472-4274



April 6, 2021

James Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H.

Dr. Enstrom:

A Trustee of any organization is required to discharge the duty of loyalty to the organization, meaning that he must place the welfare of the organization ahead of any personal interest which he may have. Your actions during the past 2+ years have only served to undermine the interests of ACSH, including repeatedly denigrating the staff, diverting other Trustees' attention to your personal vendettas, and communicating your complaints to persons outside ACSH. For instance:

- 1. In an email dated 13-Feb-2021, you sarcastically referred to Dr. Dinerstein as "the omnipotent vascular surgeon" and cc'ed your complaint to several outsiders, including Joseph Ladapo, Harvey Risch, and Peter McCullough.
- 2. In an email dated 20-Oct-2020, you undermined Dr. Berezow's credibility by falsely claiming that he has "No training or peer-reviewed journal publications in epidemiology or public health." In reality, Dr. Berezow has a certificate in Applied Biostatistics from the University of Washington, and completed coursework in epidemiology.
- 3. In an email dated 8-Apr-2019, you wrote in response to an article written by Dr. Berezow, "This kind of garbage is one reason why ACSH is failing."
- 4. In August 2018, you expressed your willingness to have a conversation about ACSH's "problems" in an email to Nicolas Martin, a former terminated employee who hosts a website with the sole mission of tarnishing the legacy of Elizabeth Whelan and ACSH.

Furthermore, on more than one occasion, you have sought to benefit yourself or your friends at ACSH's expense. For instance, when Dr. Bloom and Dr. Berezow were leading the organization following Hank Campbell's departure, you requested that they promote an article by William

Elizabeth M. Whelan, Sc.D., M.P.H. (1943-2014) (Years of Service to ACSH: 1978-2014) Founder and President, ACSH Norman E. Borlaug, Ph.D. (1914-2009) (Years of Service to ACSH: 1978-2009) Father of the "Green Revolution" Nobel Laureate

Founders Circle:

Fredrick J. Stare, M.D., Ph.D. (1910-2002) (Years of Service to ACSH: 1978-2002) Founder, Harvard Department of Nutrition

Contact Us: www.ACSH.org • acsh@acsh.org • or by mail

135 Madison Avenue, 5th Floor, 06-114 New York, New York 10016-6745 Tele. (212) 362-7044 • Fax (212) 362-4919 James Enstrom, Ph.D., M.P.H. April 6, 2021

Matt Briggs that would have encouraged readers to send donations to another organization rather than to ACSH.

At the Trustees' June 6, 2019, meeting, you ignored ACSH's successful efforts to end deficit spending and proposed that ACSH be terminated, with its website being handed to you and two friends of yours (neither of whom had been active in ACSH matters).

Your behavior has damaged the reputation of ACSH and its staff and is inconsistent with your duty of loyalty to the organization. I am writing to confirm our telephone conversation, which advised that you have lost the confidence of every other Trustee, and reiterate that you should resign as a Trustee forthwith.

Most sincerely,

Thom Golab

Thom Golab President

TG/cm

cc: Nigel Bark, Steve Whelan, Steven Modzelewski, Tanya Dorhout, Lindsey Leininger, Fred Smith, Dan Stein, Cheryl Martin

On Wed, Feb 17, 2021 at 1:46 PM nigel bark <<u>nigelmbark@gmail.com</u>> wrote:

Dear Jim,

I'm a bit surprised that you're defending Dr Lee Merrit. I listened to her talk about masks and thought it frivolous and dangerous. I read and saw some of her comments on the COVID-19 vaccines and thought they were bizarre and dangerous. It's not necessarily relevant but she is an orthopedic surgeon not a virologist or an expert on COVID-19.

I don't think she should have a platform on ACSH.

Sincerely,

Nigel

On Tue, Feb 16, 2021 at 12:07 PM JAMES ENSTROM <<u>jenstrom@ucla.edu</u>> wrote:

Dear Nigel,

I appreciate your response. "Dr. Lee Merrit, Wakefield Wannabe" is a deliberate smear on an accomplished and courageous MD and she must be given the opportunity by ACSH to defend herself against the outrageous charges by a vascular surgeon who, as far as I know, has NO expertise in treating COVID-19 patients. The "Wakefield Wannabe" after her name is a particularly evil slur because Wakefield has been charged with serious medical misconduct and his seminal Lancet paper was retracted. If ACSH does allow Dr. Merrit to defend herself, it should not be a point-counterpoint with the omnipotent Dinerstein. She should be allowed to write a stand alone response and Professor Risch should be given the opportunity to comment on her response.

Thank you for your consideration.

Jim

On Mon, Feb 15, 2021 at 7:31 PM nigel bark <<u>nigelmbark@gmail.com</u>> wrote:

Sorry for the late response, Jim. I've been away and then busy.

I have arranged to discuss this with Thom on Wednesday and then get back to you.

(I should say the point/counterpoint article on HCQ was with me not Ladapo and Risch.)

On Sat, Feb 13, 2021 at 2:00 PM JAMES ENSTROM <<u>jenstrom@ucla.edu</u>> wrote:

February 13, 2020

Dear ACSH Chairman Bark,

The omnipotent vascular surgeon Dr. Dinerstein has, for the second time since February 8, impugned the reputation and integrity of Dr. Lee Merrit in the February 13 ACSH Dispatch below. ACSH has not given Dr. Merrit an opportunity to challenge Dr. Dinerstein's claims, as I requested in my unanswered February 8 email message to you. I contend that ACSH is in direct violation of the November 23, 2020 ACSH Policy that was established by Executive Trustees at my request after the October 9, 2020 ACSH Dispatch trashed UCLA Professor Joseph Ladapo and Yale Professor Harvey Risch. Item 2 of this ACSH Policy states "We think that there should be some exploration of how scientific credibility could be ascertained for controversial or questionable articles: for example, using the scientific advisors or posting them as point/counterpoint article, as was done with the September HCQ meta-analysis [by Ladapo and Risch]."

Thus, I request that ACSH immediately give Dr. Merrit the opportunity to defend herself against Dr. Dinerstein's claims. Her defense can be done as a point/counterpoint with Dr. Dinerstein. Also, I request that Yale Professor Harvey Risch and Baylor Professor Peter McCullough be given the opportunity to assist Dr. Merrit with her defense.

Please respond to my request.

Thank you very much.

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FACE ACSH Trustee since 2006 and ACSH Scientific Advisor since 1984 jenstrom@ucla.edu

cc: ACSH Vice Chairman Stephen Modzelewski

----- Forwarded message ------

From: **ACSH** <<u>morning@acsh.org</u>>

Date: Sat, Feb 13, 2021 at 4:54 AM

Subject: COVID vaccine, herd immunity, and lies. An open letter to the EPA, the half-life of Viagra, and an explanation of food allergies.

To: <jenstrom@ucla.edu>

Weekend Edition

Welcome to the weekend—happy Valentine's Day to you and your loved ones tomorrow. Dr. Berezow kicks it off with two interrelated articles. Should the COVID vaccines be mandatory, especially when considering that we may be far closer to herd immunity than we thought. Dr. Dinerstein answers several of our readers' requests to discuss the mistruths and misdirections of Dr. Lee Merrit.

Dr. Lee Merrit, Wakefield Wannabe

The views of Dr. Merrit (pictured) – on COVID-19's story of origin, biologic effects, and organized medicine's response – are classic misdirection and misinformation. It's time to debunk this physician's dangerous distortions. **READ MORE**

From: "Dr. Harvey Risch" <<u>harvey.risch@yale.edu</u>> Date: February 8, 2021 at 11:55:28 AM PST To: JAMES ENSTROM <<u>jenstrom@ucla.edu</u>>, Nigel Bark Subject: Re: ACSH Must Allow Dr. Lee Merrit to Refute Dr. Dinerstein's Trashing

Agreed. The innuendo and smear words in this essay are shameful. They are calibrated to provoke emotional reactions not rational ones. This is a PR smear essay not a discussion of scientific issues. And, the purposive lack of providing the link to the video that is being criticized here is dishonest. It is intended to inhibit readers from seeing for themselves what Dr. Merritt actually said, i.e., to give the smear a free pass for all of its unsubstantiated claims. This is a propaganda piece, nothing else.

I echo that the ACSH has no credibility.

Harvey Risch

On 2/8/2021 2:00 PM, JAMES ENSTROM wrote: Dear ACSH Chairman Bark,

Last October ACSH Dispatch trashed UCLA Professor Joseph Ladapo and Yale Professor Harvey Risch (<u>http://scientificintegrityinstitute.org/acshabjee101420.pdf</u>) and today ACSH Dispatch trashed <u>Dr. Lee</u> <u>Merrit, Wakefield Wannabe</u>

ACSH must immediately give Dr. Merrit the opportunity to refute Dr. Dinerstein's claims that her views are "classic misdirection and misinformation" and "dangerous distortions" (read below). Because of these malicious attacks on accomplished MDs, I am now making the case that the current ACSH has NO credibility in "science and health."

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE <u>http://scientificintegrityinstitute.org/</u> jenstrom@ucla.edu

Begin forwarded message:

From: American Council on Science and Health <<u>morning@acsh.org</u>>
Date: February 8, 2021 at 4:30:28 AM PST
To: jenstrom@ucla.edu
Subject: Should COVID Vaccines Be Mandatory?
Reply-To: American Council on Science and Health <<u>morning@acsh.org</u>>

Today's Dispatch

- Dr. Lee Merrit, Wakefield Wannabe
- <u>Should COVID Vaccines Be Mandatory?</u>
- Please Help Fund Our Work
- Is It Even Organic in the First Place? Policing the Market.
- Novavax & Vaccine Efficacy

Dr. Lee Merrit, Wakefield Wannabe

The views of Dr. Merrit (pictured) – on COVID-19's story of origin, biologic effects, and organized medicine's response – are classic misdirection and misinformation. It's time to debunk this physician's dangerous distortions. **READ MORE**

From: JAMES ENSTROM <jenstrom@ucla.edu> Date: Fri, Nov 20, 2020 at 10:00 AM Subject: Enstrom Case Against Berezow & Request to Broaden ACSH To: Nigel Bark <nigelmbark@gmail.com> Cc: Thom Golab <tgolab@acsh.org>, Whelan, Stephen T. <swhelan@blankrome.com>, Stephen Modzelewski <moz@modzelewski.com>, Daniel Stein <Daniel.stein@einstein.yu.edu>

November 20, 2020

Dear ACSH Executive Committee Trustee,

Below I state my case against Alex Berezow, which I described briefly at the end of the November 18 Trustees Meeting and which I have previously discussed in detail with Trustees Bark and Golab.

Details as of October 14 are contained in the 14-page PDF2, "ACSH HCQ Does Not Help & Risch-Ladapo Response 101420" (<u>http://scientificintegrityinstitute.org/acshabjee101420.pdf</u>), which is now posted on my website. It is important that you understand these details, because they relate directly to the integrity of ACSH. Key aspects of my overall case are as follows:

Berezow TRASHED the September 30 Ladapo-Risch HCQ and COVID-19 Meta-Analysis in his October 9 Dispatch article (PDF2 pp 1-2), resulting in several harsh reader comments, like "I am deeply disappointed in the political nature of this article. . . . This is a shameful piece and should be withdrawn" (PDF2 pp 3-4). At my request, UCLA Professor of Medicine Joseph Ladapo (https://www.uclahealth.org/joseph-ladapo), the lead author, and Yale Professor of Epidemiology Harvey Risch (https://publichealth.yale.edu/profile/harvey_risch/) responded in detail to the criticism of their Meta-Analysis made by three anonymous ACSH reviewers (PDF2 pp 5-11). Apparently, one of the reviewers was Chuck Dinerstein, but the other two reviewers remain anonymous and their qualifications are unknown. Dr. Risch concluded "Now having gone over these comments, I would say that this is completely bogus and has no relevant scientific expertise involved." The original October 1 Enstrom request regarding the Meta-Analysis and the October 8 Golab response with reviewer comments are included for reference (PDF2 pp 12-14). Rather than addressing and accepting the criticism of Drs. Risch and Ladapo, Berezow reran his original October 9 Dispatch article as a prominent first link within his article "COVID Vs. Cable News"

(https://www.acsh.org/news/2020/10/13/covid-vs-cable-news-coronavirus-misinformation-rampant-15089), which was posted as a Dispatch item on both October 23 and October 24. ACSH Chair Bark agreed with me that Berezow's attack was wrong and he prepared a strong "Point" defending the

Ladapo-Risch HCQ Meta-Analysis in the November 9 Dispatch "Point-

Counterpoint" (<u>https://www.acsh.org/news/2020/11/09/hydroxychloroquine-does-it-have-clinical-value-covid-19-point-counterpoint-discussion-15130</u>). This "Point-Counterpoint" generated several positive reader comments (which could not be posted because the link was not established on November 9). As of today, November 20, Berezow has not withdrawn his October 9 article and has not acknowledged the validity of the Ladapo-Risch HCQ Meta-Analysis.

The current ACSH is nothing like the original ACSH. The ACSH under the leadership of Beth Whelan is described in the 30-page 2005-2006 ACSH Annual Report

(http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/ACSHReport032607.pdf). Nigel Bark and I are the only 2006 Trustees still associated with ACSH. My association with ACSH began with this January 4, 1984 Beth Whelan letter initiating my service as an ACSH Scientific Advisor (http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/ACSHWhelan010484.pdf).

(http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/ACSHWhelan010484.pdf).

With Dispatch Items on COVID-19 as the current focus of ACSH and with Berezow as the lead author of these items, ACSH is no longer the "pro-science consumer advocacy organization" that it was under Beth. Furthermore, ACSH now faces strong competition from many high quality "pro-science" organizations and most of them did not exist in 1978. I currently work with and/or support: Heritage Foundation, National Association of Scholars, Heartland Institute, Reason Foundation, Claremont Institute, Doctors for Disaster Preparedness, National Review, Manhattan Institute, Independent Institute, Competitive Enterprise Institute, JunkScience.com, and WMBriggs.com. In addition, I support organizations that defend academic freedom, particularly, Foundation for Individual Rights in Education and American Center for Law and Justice. All of these organizations generate public support based on the quality and validity of their output, which is not limited to Dispatch Items on COVID-19 by authors like Berezow.

Given this strong competition, I believe that ACSH must broaden its focus and improve the quality of its output. I recommend that ACSH allow the posting of a limited number of unrestricted Dispatch Items or Reports by Trustees and by Scientific Advisors who the Trustees designate. The Trustee-initiated contributions can then be evaluated by the ACSH readers and supporters, in order to determine if they improve ACSH.

Thank you very much for your consideration.

Best regards,

Jim Enstrom

From: JAMES ENSTROM <jenstrom@ucla.edu> Date: Tue, Oct 20, 2020 at 9:30 AM Subject: VP Berezow is Damaging Scientific Credibility of ACSH To: Thom Golab <tgolab@acsh.org> Cc: Joseph A. Ladapo <jladapo@mednet.ucla.edu>, Harvey Risch <harvey.risch@yale.edu>

October 20, 2020

Dear Fellow ACSH Trustee,

I have very strong evidence that ACSH Vice President of Scientific Communications Alex Berezow (Berezow) is seriously damaging the scientific credibility and integrity of ACSH, as I explained in my October 17 email message below to ACSH President Thom Golab (Golab). In his October 19 reply to me Golab does not accept my evidence and is quite satisfied with Berezow's harsh criticism on October 9 of the September 30 HCQ—COVID-19 meta-analysis by UCLA Professor of Medicine Joseph A. Ladapo, MD, PhD (webpage) and Yale Professor of Epidemiology Harvey A. Risch, MD, PhD (webpage). Furthermore, Golab has completely ignored the point-by-point rebuttal given by these Professors to the criticism of their meta-analysis by three anonymous ACSH reviewers and Berezow. My October 17 email message and my 14-page PDF2 provide all of the relevant details.

I find it TOTALLY UNACCEPTABLE that 1) Berezow, a science writer with a 2010 PhD in microbiology and NO training or peer-reviewed journal publications in epidemiology or public health, is allowed to use ACSH.org to flippantly TRASH the research of two highly accomplished Professors and 2) Golab, with no formal training in epidemiology or public health, dismisses all my criticism of Berezow and never allows me access to ACSH.org.

Thus, I request that the two Professors and I be allowed to publish our response to Berezow on ACSH.org. This is a serious matter regarding the credibility of ACSH and I hope that you will examine it carefully. You are welcome to communicate directly with the Professors and me, as well as with Berezow and Golab. If this matter cannot be resolved before the November Trustees Meeting, then I request that it be addressed during the meeting.

Thank you very much for your consideration.

Best regards,

Jim James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE jenstrom@ucla.edu (310) 472-4274

------ Forwarded message ------From: JAMES ENSTROM <<u>jenstrom@ucla.edu</u>> Date: Sat, Oct 17, 2020 at 8:50 AM Subject: VP Berezow is Damaging Scientific Credibility of ACSH To: Thom Golab <<u>tgolab@acsh.org</u>> October 17, 2020

Re: VP Berezow is Damaging Scientific Credibility of ACSH

Dear President Golab,

I have very strong evidence that ACSH Vice President of Scientific Communications Alex Berezow (Berezow) is seriously damaging the scientific credibility and integrity of ACSH. My evidence is limited (for now) to two prime examples summarized below and documented in the two attached PDFs.

I request that Berezow be suspended from further writing for ACSH until he satisfactorily responds to my evidence and until the other Trustees assess my request and we formulate an appropriate course of action. As of now, you are the only person who has received my request.

Example 1 (see PDF1: "ACSH Berezow Libel re USRTK & USRTK Libel & Enstrom Rebut 101520")

Summary: Berezow libeled US Right to Know (USRTK) and staff in 2017, 2019, and 2020 (PDF1 pp 1-8). In retaliation, USRTK libeled ACSH Trustee Enstrom and ACSH SA Geoffrey Kabat in 2018 and 2019 with false tobacco claims from 2005 (PDF1 pp 9-21). Enstrom has informed USRTK staff of the Enstrom rebuttals in 2005 (PDF1 pp 22-30) and 2007 (PDF1 pp 31-58) to libelous tobacco claims by Glantz and others. Enstrom has made a verbal agreement with USRTK staff that has the goal of removing libelous claims from USRTK and ACSH websites.

Example 2 (see PDF2: "ACSH HCQ Does Not Help AB & Risch-Ladapo Response 101420")

Summary: Berezow TRASHED the September 30 Ladapo-Risch HCQ and COVID-19 Meta-Analysis in his October 9 Dispatch article (PDF2 pp 1-2), resulting in several harsh reader comments, like "I am deeply disappointed in the political nature of this article. . . . This is a shameful piece and should be withdrawn" (PDF2 pp 3-4). In spite of very demanding schedules, Yale Professor of Epidemiology Harvey Risch and UCLA Professor of Medicine Joseph Ladapo responded in detail to the comments on their Meta-Analysis made by three anonymous ACSH reviewers (PDF2 pp 5-11). Dr. Risch concluded "Now having gone over these comments, I would say that this is completely bogus and has no relevant scientific expertise involved." The original October 1 Enstrom request regarding the Meta-Analysis and the October 8 Golab response with reviewer comments are included for reference (PDF2 pp 12-14). The reviewers should be identified and they, along with Berezow, should respond to Drs. Risch and Ladapo.

Please review and, hopefully, we can discuss this on Monday.

Thank you very much for your attention to my request.

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE

2 Attachments

PDF2 can be found at this link: <u>http://scientificintegrityinstitute.org/acshabjee101420.pdf</u> PDF1 is not provided so that the focus is on PDF2, but it can provided upon request [http://scientificintegrityinstitute.org/acshabjee101520.pdf] From: **CHERYL MARTIN** <martinc@acsh.org> Date: Fri, May 31, 2019 at 11:32 AM Subject: ACSH Board of Trustees Meeting June 6, 2019 To: Whelan T. Stephen <swhelan@blankrome.com>, Stephen Modzelewski <moz@modzelewski.com>, Tanya Dorhout <tanya.dorhout@gmail.com>, James Enstrom <jenstrom@ucla.edu>, Fred Smith Jr. <fsmith@cei.org>, Thomas P. Stossel <ThomasPStossel@gmail.com>, Thomas Golab <thomgolab@gmail.com>, Nigel Bark <nigelmbark@gmail.com>, Daniel Stein <Daniel.stein@einstein.yu.edu>

Dear ACSH Trustees:

This is a reminder, and important information, is for the ACSH Board of Trustees meeting scheduled **June 6, 2019**. *Please mark this date on your calendar*. Attached are documents to be reviewed in advance of the meeting that include:

- 1. Meeting Agenda
- 2. Financial Report (@ 4/30/2019)
- 3. Minutes of the Board of Trustees Meeting, October 25, 2018
- 4. Board of Trustees Term Expirations and Standing Committees
- 5. A proposal prepared by Jim Enstrom for discussion during the Executive Session with Trustees only.,

We look forward to your participation in this very important meeting addressing major changes and reorganization in recent months to keep ACSH viable. *We are also asking all trustees to think of at least one candidate to join the board. With Herb London's passing, and Fred Smith's disability we need two replacements just to maintain the current level.*

Steve Whelan has generously offered to host the meeting again at his *new office*.

Please note his NEW office location:

BLANKROME 1271 Avenue of the Americas at 50th Street New York, NY 10020

Confirmed to Participate:

In- person: Nigel Bark, Tanya Dorhout, Thom Golab and Dan Stein **By Conference phone:** Jim Enstrom, Steve Modzelewski and Tom Stossel

Unavailable: Fred Smith

ACSH Staff Attendees: Josh Bloom, Alex Berezow and Cheryl Martin.

Time: 12:00 PM Buffet lunch available; 12:30 PM EST Meeting will commence.

If you have any questions please contact me. Also if your plans for attendance change please notify me ASAP.

Many thanks and best regards,

Cheryl

Cheryl E. Martin Director of Operations American Council on Science and Health P.O. Box 1791 New York, NY 10156-1791 212-362-7044 <u>martinc@acsh.org</u> <u>Website | Facebook | Twitter</u>

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE:

This e-mail and any attachments may contain information that is privileged, confidential, or otherwise exempt from disclosure under applicable law. It is intended solely for the use of the individual or entity to whom it is addressed. If you are not the intended recipient or if it appears from the context or otherwise that you have received this e-mail in error, please advise me immediately by reply e-mail, keep the contents confidential, and immediately delete the message and any attachments from your system and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments and destroy any printouts.

Enstrom Proposal to Continue <u>ACSH.org</u> if ACSH Itself Cannot Continue

Prepared by James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE May 24, 2019

Presented for discussion and consideration by Board of Trustees American Council on Science and Health June 6, 2019 Meeting

This proposal is an emergency backup plan to be implemented only if the current ACSH Executive Team cannot maintain ACSH as a fiscally viable organization consistent with its Mission.

I propose to have the <u>ACSH.org</u> website, existing publications, and potentially other assets maintained by a small group of scientists who have had a long relationship with ACSH, Beth Whelan, and its Mission. In particular, I will discuss three highly qualified and scientifically active individuals who have extensive experience in maintaining and effectively using their own inexpensive personal websites. Importantly, these individuals have long histories of financial stability and economical operation.

This backup plan would not involve the current ACSH Executive Team because it would only be implemented if ACSH itself cannot continue. The specific details of the transition from ACSH to <u>ACSH.org</u> need to be worked out and this process requires the cooperation of the current ACSH Executive Team. The goal would be to base <u>ACSH.org</u> in New York City and make it as effective as possible, primarily with the assistance of volunteers who have been associated with ACSH.

The importance of this proposal is that it will preserve the 41-year ACSH Mission and the legacy of Beth Whelan. It would be a monumental blow to the ACSH Mission of publicly supporting evidence-based science and medicine if ACSH goes out of business entirely.



MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE ACSH BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Thursday, June 6, 2019 Time: 12:00 PM to 3:30 PM EST

Board Meeting Hosted at: BLANKROME 1271 Avenue of the Americas at 50th Street New York, NY 10020

Trustees Attending:

<u>In- person</u>: Nigel Bark, Tanya Dorhout, Thom Golab, Dan Stein and Steve Whelan <u>By Conference phone</u>: Jim Enstrom, Steve Modzelewski and Tom Stossel

> Trustees Unavailable: Fred Smith

ACSH Officers and Executive Staff Attending:

Alex Berezow, Josh Bloom and Cheryl Martin

Proceedings: chaired by ACSH Chairman Dr. Nigel Bark

- Meeting called to order at 12:40 EST by ACSH Chairman Nigel Bark. A quorum was established with eight (8) trustees of nine (9) in attendance.
- The ACSH Board formally recorded acceptance of the resignation of ACSH president Hank Campbell on November 7, 2018, and acknowledged appointment of ACSH's Dr. Josh Bloom as Acting President and Dr. Alex Berezow as Vice President of Scientific Affairs on December 3, 2018.
- Minutes of the ACSH board meeting held October 25. 2018 were unanimously approved and accepted without further revision.
- ACSH Trustee Steve Whelan reported on the termination of Washington DC office lease for a negotiated sum of \$45,000. Whelan also advised on the results of the May 2019 court proceedings with the 110 East 42 St NY landlord, SL Green that resulting in the court awarding landlord ACSH's security deposit of \$76,000 for rent arrears, acknowledged the surrender of premises to SL Green, and allowed landlord to reserve right to pursue future arrears of the lease. Whelan acknowledged that

- ACSH trustee Thomas Stossel suggested that ACSH reach out to National Academy of Science for a partnership and potential funding project with that organization. Stossel will share a copy of their strategic plan with Alex.
- The Board went into executive session to discuss Jim Enstrom's proposed backup plan for ACSH's continued survival in the future should current efforts fail.
- With no further business the meeting adjourned at 3:15PM.

#

Actions of the Board: Chaired by ACSH Chairman Nigel Bark

- The board unanimously resolved to accept the minutes of the trustee meeting held October 25, 2018.
- The board unanimously recorded acceptance of the resignation of Hank Campbell on November 7, 2018, and appointment of Dr. Josh Bloom as Acting President, and Dr. Alex Berezow as Vice President, Scientific Affairs on December 3, 2018.
- The board unanimously resolved to approve the resolution of appreciation for the late ACSH Trustee Dr. Herbert London that reads as follows:

"WHEREAS, our esteemed trustee, Dr. Herbert I. London, passed away in early November, 2018; NOW, THEREFOR, BE IT HEREBY RESOLVED, that the trustees of the American Council on Science and Health hereby express their appreciation for the devoted time, energy, and counsel which Dr. London made to the governance and direction of this organization during his tenure as a trustee of ACSH, and hereby direct that the minutes of this meeting include this resolution, a copy of which is to be shared with his widow, Vicki London."

- The Board unanimously approved the projected organization budget for FY 2020.
- The Board unanimously resolved to re-elect the trustees whose terms expire 6/30/2018 to three year terms that expire 6/30/2021; they include: Fred Smith, Thom Golab, Daniel Stein, and Jim Enstrom.
- The Board resolved and elected Steve Whelan as chair of Project Planning Committee; Stephen Modzelewski as chair of the Compensation Committee in absentia; and Dan Stein as chair of the Nominating Committee. Tanya Dorhout accepted nomination to succeed Thom Golab on compensation committee (given his employment status with ACSH).
- The Board resolved unanimously to accept nomination of Wolfgang H Vogel, Ph.D. to the ACSH Board of Scientific Advisors.