

**From:** James E. Enstrom <jenstrom@ucla.edu>  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 20, 2015 2:18 PM  
**To:** Ronald O. Loveridge <ronald.loveridge@ucr.edu>  
**Cc:** J. Daniel Hare <daniel.hare@ucr.edu>; Sarjeet S. Gill <arjeet.gill@ucr.edu>; Craig V. Byus <craig.byus@ucr.edu>; Roger Atkinson <roger.atkinson@ucr.edu>; Gloria Gonzalez-Rivera <gloria.gonzalez@ucr.edu>; Matthew J. Barth <matthew.barth@ucr.edu>; J. Wayne Miller <wayne.miller@ucr.edu>; M. Thomas Durbin <tom.durbin@ucr.edu>; Guoyuan Wu <guoyuan.wu@ucr.edu>; Arthur M. Winer <amwiner@ucla.edu>; Heather Arias <harias@arb.ca.gov>; Linda T. Smith <lsmith@arb.ca.gov>; Hien T. Tran <htran@arb.ca.gov>; Todd P. Sax <tsax@arb.ca.gov>; C. Arden Pope III <cap3@byu.edu>; Ian MacMillan <imacmillan@aqmd.gov>; Lisha Smith <lsmith@aqmd.gov>; Veera Tyagi <vtyagi@aqmd.gov>; Jean J. Ospital <jospital@aqmd.gov>; Philip M. Fine <pfine@aqmd.gov>; Henry Hogo <hhogo@aqmd.gov>; Mohsen Nazemi <mnazemi@aqmd.gov>; Samuel Soret <ssoret@llu.edu>; Jane V. Hall <jhall@fullerton.edu>  
**Subject:** Moreno Valley OKs WLC in spite of CARB/SCAQMD Claims

August 20, 2015

Ronald O. Loveridge, Ph.D. (Stanford)  
UC Riverside + CARB & SCAQMD  
[ronald.loveridge@ucr.edu](mailto:ronald.loveridge@ucr.edu)

Dear Professor Loveridge,

In spite of scientifically unjustified opposition from CARB, SCAQMD, and you, the World Logistics Center in Moreno Valley is moving forward (<http://www.pe.com/articles/project-777502-city-benzeevi.html>). Approval of this project marks the beginning of the end of the ability of CARB and SCAQMD to use false air pollution health claims and illegal regulations to stop environmentally sound and socioeconomically important projects in California. Accurate information about current air pollution health impacts is contained in my July 13, 2015 letter (<http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/WLCFEIR071315.pdf>), the August 14, 2015 letter by Professor William M. Briggs (<http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/WLCRFPBRIGGS081415.pdf>), and the August 14, 2015 email letter by Professor Robert F. Phalen (<http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/WLCRFPPhALEN081415.pdf>).

Approval of this project represents partial vindication of the concerns that four distinguished scientists expressed to you on December 3, 2008, as explained on page 23 of the November 16, 2009 37-page document submitted to CARB by John G. Telles, M.D. (<http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/Telles111609.pdf>). As a prominent CARB and SCAQMD Board Member, you should not have unethically and unjustly ignored all of our important scientific, legal, and economic concerns about CARB/SCAQMD science and

regulations. Hopefully, other UC Riverside academics will make the effort to learn about the valid concerns that we had in 2008 and that we have now. In any case, dozens of scientists across the country and the U.S. Congress are taking these concerns seriously.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, Ph.D. (Stanford), M.P.H. (UCLA)  
UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute  
[jenstrom@ucla.edu](mailto:jenstrom@ucla.edu)

cc:

Key UC Riverside Academics:

J. Daniel Hare <[daniel.hare@ucr.edu](mailto:daniel.hare@ucr.edu)>, Sarjeet S. Gill <[arjeet.gill@ucr.edu](mailto:arjeet.gill@ucr.edu)>, Craig V. Byus <[craig.byus@ucr.edu](mailto:craig.byus@ucr.edu)>, Roger Atkinson <[roger.atkinson@ucr.edu](mailto:roger.atkinson@ucr.edu)>, Gloria Gonzalez-Rivera <[gloria.gonzalez@ucr.edu](mailto:gloria.gonzalez@ucr.edu)>, Matthew J. Barth <[matthew.barth@ucr.edu](mailto:matthew.barth@ucr.edu)>, J. Wayne Miller <[wayne.miller@ucr.edu](mailto:wayne.miller@ucr.edu)>, M. Thomas Durbin <[tom.durbin@ucr.edu](mailto:tom.durbin@ucr.edu)>, Guoyuan Wu <[guoyuan.wu@ucr.edu](mailto:guoyuan.wu@ucr.edu)>, Arthur M. Winer <[amwiner@ucla.edu](mailto:amwiner@ucla.edu)>

Key CARB Officials:

Heather Arias <[harias@arb.ca.gov](mailto:harias@arb.ca.gov)>, Linda T. Smith <[lsmith@arb.ca.gov](mailto:lsmith@arb.ca.gov)>, Hien T. Tran <[htran@arb.ca.gov](mailto:htran@arb.ca.gov)>, Todd P. Sax <[tsax@arb.ca.gov](mailto:tsax@arb.ca.gov)>, C. Arden Pope III <[cap3@byu.edu](mailto:cap3@byu.edu)>

Key SCAQMD Officials:

Ian MacMillan <[imacmillan@aqmd.gov](mailto:imacmillan@aqmd.gov)>, Lisha Smith <[lsmith@aqmd.gov](mailto:lsmith@aqmd.gov)>, Veera Tyagi <[vtyagi@aqmd.gov](mailto:vtyagi@aqmd.gov)>, Jean J. Ospital <[jospital@aqmd.gov](mailto:jospital@aqmd.gov)>, Philip M. Fine <[pfine@aqmd.gov](mailto:pfine@aqmd.gov)>, Henry Hogo <[hhogo@aqmd.gov](mailto:hhogo@aqmd.gov)>, Mohsen Nazemi <[mnazemi@aqmd.gov](mailto:mnazemi@aqmd.gov)>, Samuel Soret <[ssoret@llu.edu](mailto:ssoret@llu.edu)>, Jane V. Hall <[jhall@fullerton.edu](mailto:jhall@fullerton.edu)>