

November 30, 2018

Readers' Representative
Los Angeles Times
2300 East Imperial Highway
El Segundo, CA 90245
readers.representative@latimes.com
(877) 554-4000

Dear Readers' Representative,

I am lodging a formal complaint against Los Angeles Times investigative reporter Susanne Rust (<https://www.latimes.com/la-bio-susanne-rust-staff.html>). My complaint is based on her November 15, 2018 email to Dr. Willie Soon regarding her "story about the EPA's new proposed rule - the one on strengthening transparency in science," my November 15, 2018 email to her, and her November 20, 2018 email to Dr. Soon, all three of which are shown below.

I request that you investigate my contention that she does not intend to write an article about the EPA Transparency Rule, but rather intends to write an article impugning the honesty and integrity of Dr. Soon, me, and/or others based largely on an out-of-context and potentially libelous interpretation of improperly obtained private emails between Dr. Soon, myself, and others.

Also, I request that Ms. Rust immediately provide the following information to both you and me:

- 1) An exact and complete copy of the "email from Jan. 2017 to C (name redacted) and Enstrom, among others" that Dr. Soon allegedly wrote, which she partially quoted in her November 20, 2018 email.
- 2) A list of all emails sent by Dr. Soon and me that she has obtained without our permission, such as, the private "email from Jan. 2017".
- 3) A clear explanation of how she obtained the private "email from Jan. 2017" and any other emails that she possesses that are written by Dr. Soon and me.
- 4) Any draft or published article(s) that she has written related to her November 15 and 20, 2018 emails.

If I do not receive a prompt and satisfactory response to the above requests, I will pursue this matter in other ways.

Thank you very much for your immediate attention to this formal complaint.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE
UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute
<http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/>
jenstrom@ucla.edu
(310) 472-4274

EDITED by JEE to Preserve the Privacy of Certain Names and Email Addresses

From: **Rust, Susanne** <susanne.rust@latimes.com>

Date: Tue, Nov 20, 2018 at 11:11 AM

Subject: Re: Media request/ LA Times

To: Willie Soon

Hi,

I received a call from Dr. Enstrom. Thank you for putting me in touch with someone who has worked on the issue.

But I did want to talk to you more about your contact with C [John Doe 1]. I understand you communicate with him and a broader group via email fairly regularly. Can you tell me more about this group? Is it a professional group? (includes C, John Doe 2, John Doe 3, John Enstrom, John Doe 4, John Doe 5, John Doe 6 and others). Friends?

Also, I wanted to understand a couple of comments of yours that I saw in an email from Jan. 2017 to C and Enstrom, among others.

You wrote this about the Harvard study I referred to:

"I know you guys already commented and rebutted this silly yellow paper. If you read this PR they actually said 22 millions people died during the study period. Ha the victims are super clear: female, black, and poor (imagine we can no longer afford Medicaid) and no safe level: god help us all if we need such huge amount hubris and manipulated scams. Steve, you and I can start a morgue business and we will be billionaires."

Can you tell me: 1) What you found weak about this paper?; 2) what you find humorous, or unbelievable?, particularly about the demographic you singled out as being most vulnerable (black, female and poor) - or why you found that funny?; 3) what do you imagine would happen if we could no longer afford Medicaid (or what were you getting at); 4) are you suggesting the study was a scam? 5) and I assume your last sentence is meant to be sarcastic, but, can you explain a bit better what you mean? 6) What is your expertise in air pollution research? 7) What is your current role/ title?

Happy to talk on the phone, if you like. 650-804-6790

Thanks for your help.

Subject:Details on LA Times Request re EPA Transparency Rule

Date: Thu, 15 Nov 2018 10:17:30 -0800

From: James E. Enstrom <jenstrom@ucla.edu>

To: 'Susanne Rust' <susanne.rust@latimes.com>

November 15, 2018

Dear Susanne Rust,

I am a close scientific colleague of Dr. Willie Soon and he informed me that you are working on a story about the EPA Transparency Rule. I am a scientific expert on this rule because I conducted a March 28, 2017 reanalysis of the ACS CPS II data used in the seminal Pope 1995 article that underlies the 1997 EPA PM2.5 NAAQS. My reanalysis shows NO robust relationship between PM2.5 and total mortality in the US and seriously challenges the validity of the PM2.5 NAAQS. I have attached my August 14, 2018 EPA public comments that describe my research. These comments can also be found at this link: <https://www.regulations.gov/document?D=EPA-HQ-OA-2018-0259-8290> .

Please call me to discuss my reanalysis and the EPA Transparency Rule.

Sincerely yours,

James E. Enstrom, PhD, MPH, FFACE
UCLA and Scientific Integrity Institute
[http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/
jenstrom@ucla.edu](http://www.scientificintegrityinstitute.org/jenstrom@ucla.edu)
(310) 472-4274

Susanne Rust: 650-804-6790

From: Rust, Susanne
Sent: Thursday, November 15, 2018 8:02:43 AM
To: Willie Soon
Subject: Media request/ LA Times

Dear Dr. Soon,

I'm working on a story about the EPA's new proposed rule - the one on strengthening transparency in science - and was introduced to C [John Doe 1], at [C's location].

I wonder if I could talk to you about your connection with him?

I also wanted to ask you about this study:

<https://www.hsph.harvard.edu/news/press-releases/air-pollution-premature-death-u-s-seniors/>

Thank you. You can email or call me at: 650-804-6790



[Short-term exposure to low levels of air pollution linked with premature death among U.S. seniors | News | Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health - Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health | Powerful ideas for a healthier world](https://www.hsph.harvard.edu/news/press-releases/air-pollution-premature-death-u-s-seniors/)

www.hsph.harvard.edu

Boston, MA – Short-term exposures to fine particulate air pollution and ozone—even at levels well below current national safety standards—were linked to higher risk of premature death among the elderly in the U.S. according to a new study from Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health. The ...

Reporter, The Los Angeles Times
650-804-6790